Forecast for 2020:

storm not only in the Azov Sea, but also in the Black Sea around occupied Crimea

Russia's Economic War Against Ukraine

Andrii Klymenko, Tetyana Guchakova
Brussels, February, 2020
Andriy Klymenko is a Crimean expert and journalist, co-founder and editor-in-chief of the online Black Sea News portal www.blackseanews.net. Before the occupation of Crimea, he lived and worked in Yalta. Klymenko is the author of many development strategies of the Crimean cities, economy sectors and peninsula as a whole. Economist Emeritus of the Autonomous Republic of Crimea A. Klymenko is currently being persecuted by the FSB for resisting the Crimean occupation and is on the official Russian Federation list of terrorists and extremists. Since 2014, together with the rest of the news portal staff, he has been working in Kyiv as the Chairman of the Supervisory Board and the Crimean Department of the Maidan of Foreign Affairs and Head of the joint Monitoring Group with the Black Sea Institute of Strategic Studies that focuses on the issues of compliance with international sanctions against the RF imposed due to the occupation and illegal annexation of Crimea.

Tetyana Guchakova is a Crimean economic expert and journalist, co-founder and chief executive of the Black Sea News online portal www.blackseanews.net. Before the occupation of Crimea, she lived and worked in Yalta. Guchakova is a business consultant, author of many Crimea development strategies, including those of the peninsula’s main cities and industries, who is currently being persecuted by the FSB for resisting the Crimean occupation. Since 2015, together with the rest of the BSN staff, Tetyana Guchakova has been working in Kyiv. She is the lead expert of the Maidan of Foreign Affairs’ Crimean Department and its joint Monitoring Group with the Black Sea Institute of Strategic Studies that focuses on the issues of compliance with international sanctions against the RF imposed due to the occupation and illegal annexation of Crimea.
You can get e-versions of our books and new reviews. Email us at:

Tetyana Guchakova
Chairman of the Board of the Black Sea Institute of Strategic Studies
Tel: +360 50 324-39-37
Email: bguchakova@gmail.com
website: www.blackseanews.net

Andrii Klymenko
Chief Editor
Head of the Monitoring Group
Tel: +360 50 324-25-36
Email: tm09@gmail.com
website: www.blackseanews.net

Forecast for 2020:

Storm not only in the Azov Sea, but also in the Black Sea around occupied Crimea

Russia’s Economic War Against Ukraine in the Sea of Azov as of February 1, 2020

The Technology of Blocking the Mariupol and Berdiansk Ports

Ankri Klymenko, Tetyana Guchakova, Olga Korbut
Kyiv, February 10, 2020
Threats to Ukraine in the Black and Azov seas
All of these objects have also acquired a new vital function — namely, that of the air, surface and underwater monitoring stations (see details from our colleagues in the Dual-Purpose Gas Streams).
In the first days of the 2014 Crimea occupation, Russia’s special forces seized the Ukrainian Chornomornaftogaz offshore drilling platforms not only right off Crimea, but also, at the Odessa field.

The annexed shelf is now guarded round-the-clock by a group of the Russia’s Black Sea Fleet's missile ships.

The volume of gas produced there over the years of occupation has already amounted to about 10 billion cubic meters.
The northwestern Black Sea. The occupied sea and the distances from the offshore drilling platforms on the Ukrainian shelf seized by the RF to Odesa and occupied Crimea.
The main routes of sea-going ships from/to the Bosporus strait to/from the Ukrainian ports on the Black Sea. They run between the coast of the Odesa region and the occupied part of the Ukrainian shelf.
Between July 1-12, 2019, during the Sea Breeze-2019, one of the Black Sea exercise regions that stretched from the Ukrainian Zmiiny Island near Odessa coast to Cape Tarkhankut in Crimea was closed off by the Russian Federation by publishing the International Maritime Danger Warning.

But as of July 24, 2019, to obstruct Georgian-American Agile Spirit 2019 training, the Russian Federation has closed already five regions in the Black Sea, including a significant area in the exclusive maritime economic zone of Bulgaria and Romania, and almost entirely the eastern part of the Black Sea from Sochi to Turkey.

The total area of the Black Sea regions shut off by the Russian Navy in July 2019 alone exceeds 120,000 square kilometers, or more than ¼ of the total Black Sea area. Obviously, the purpose here is to gradually get everyone accustomed to the fact that the entire Black Sea is a zone of Russian influence, thus, gradually squeezing NATO out of the region.
On 2 January 2020, the Black Sea was blocked by the RF through the issuance of the international maritime warning NAVTEX of the danger related to conducting live fire and naval exercises. It looked as follows:

On 9 January 2020, missile-firing exercises, including hypersonic missiles firing, of the Black Sea and Northern Fleets were conducted with missiles being launched from the sea, air, and shore.

For the first time since Soviet times (!), such a huge naval group of the RF participated in the exercises in the Black Sea: 40 ships, submarines, and more than 40 planes and helicopters.
The Creeping De Facto Annexation of the Black Sea: Casus belli

Authority: NAVAREA III 1374/19 281203Z NOV 19
(Ukrainian NAVY)
1. Naval training from 01 DEC19 to 01 MAR20, from 0600 UTC to 1800 UTC. In area bounded by:
   46-00.0N 031-41.0E, 46-00.0N 031-54.9E, 46-02.0N 032-17.9E, 45-54.0N 032-35.4E, 45-40.0N 032-22.0E.
22. CANCEL THIS MSG on 011900UTC MAR 20

Authority: NAVAREA III 134/20 311152Z JAN 20.
(Russian Black Sea Fleet)
1. Missile and gunnery firing exercises, 01 thru 29 FEB20, except Sundays, from 0500 UTC to 1700 UTC. Navigation temporarily dangerous in area bounded by:
   45-42N 032-18E  
   45-49N 032-28E  
   45-41N 032-43E  
   45-34N 032-33E
2. CANCEL THIS MSG on 291800 UTC FEB20.
On 15 February 2020, the ship of the Coast Guard of the RF detained a boat with 4 Ukrainian fishermen in the Sea of Azov, arrested them, and transported them to occupied Crimea, to the port of Kerch.
The seized Crimean plants Morye and Zaliv are currently building nine new missile corvettes with the total of 72 Caliber-NK cruise missiles on board. Overall, from mid-2018 on, the RF Black Sea Fleet will now be replenished exclusively with the boats made at the seized Ukrainian shipyards in Crimea.

Zelenodolsk Plant named after Gorky builds new ships with Caliber missiles at the seized Ukrainian shipyard Zaliv in the occupied Kerch, 2018. Photos from the BlackSeaNews archive

На трофейних кримських заводах «Море» та «Залив» у Феодосії та Керчі будується 9 новітніх ракетних корветів, кількість крилатих ракет «Калибр-НК» на їх борту складе 72. Корабельний склад ЧФ РФ буде поповнюватись вже не з російських, а зі стапелів захоплених українських верфей.
A Project 22160 corvette Pavel Derzhavin — is the first warship built entirely at the Russia-seized Zaliv shipyard in Kerch since the occupation of Crimea. The ship was laid down on February 18, 2016 and launched on February 21, 2019.

Tonnage: 1500 t, length: 91 m, beam: 14.2 m, draft: 4.4 m. Max speed: 27 knots, range: 6000 miles. Autonomy: 60 days. Crew: 24. Weapons: 1x76 mm AK-176MA. Caliber missile container set-up capability. Helipad and hangar.)
2. Russia’s Activities in Regard to the Seized Ukrainian Defense and Other Strategic Enterprises

Russian Defense Entities that Collaborate with the Seized Crimean Ukrboronprom Enterprises

For Russia, the occupied Crimea is not only a huge military base, but also a powerful component of its military-industrial complex.

At present, the process of technological integration of Crimean enterprises in the Russian military-industrial complex is complete, while its legal integration is nearing completion.

As early as April 4, 2014, an ad-hoc meeting of the ministry’s board, the Russian Army Defense Minister Sergei Shoigu announced his intention to provide the industry of the occupied peninsula with the state defense orders, emphasizing the importance of effectively utilizing the manufacturing and technological potential of the Crimean defense industry.

In mid-April 2014, Russia’s Kommersant reported that the Ministry of Defense had already compiled the list of 24 Crimean enterprises of interest to the agency.

Reference to the sources in the ministry, the newspaper reported that all has been done in line with the directives of President Vladimir Putin and the process is being supervised by Deputy Minister of Defense Yuri Borisov. Currently, the proposal on the efficient use of the enterprises is being developed.

According to Borisov himself, we will start working on ensuring the workload for the enterprises after finalizing all the formal procedures, such as licensing and registration.

The informal procedures, the Russian Deputy Minister is referring to, mean, foremost, the expropriation of Ukrainian public and private enterprises.

All the peninsula’s defense enterprises were nationalized by Russia in the first months of the Crimean occupation, and most of the state defense enterprises – in the first two weeks.

Almost all Crimean defense companies are now either being swallowed by the large Russian corporations, leased by Russian enterprises or at least, have so-called curators in Russia.

The institute of such curators was officially introduced in 2016, when the Ministry of Industry and Trade of the Russian Federation ordered that the Crimean enterprises were assigned supervision. The responsibility of the curators is to share work orders with the factories they supervise and ensure their modernization.

That means that imposing sanctions against the seized Crimean enterprises does mean nothing without imposing them on the Russian defense enterprises affiliated with those.

This publication analyzes the activity of the RF in regard to the Crimean defense enterprises that are part of the Ukrboronprom concern.

All the peninsula’s defense enterprises were nationalized by Russia in the first months of the Crimean occupation, and most of the state defense enterprises – in the first two weeks.

Sanctions against the seized Crimean enterprises are meaningless without sanctions against Russian defense enterprises affiliated with those.

At the beginning of 2014, the Ukrboronprom concern included 13 enterprises, namely:

- JSC Feodosia Shipyard Morye
- SE Feodosia Optical Plant
- SE Violent Plant
- SE Design and Technology Bureau Sudostkompleks
- SE Scientific Research Institute of Aero Resilient Systems
- SE Yevpatoriya Aviation Repair Plant
- SE Severstal Aircraft Plant
- SE Skloplast
- SE Feodosia Ship and Mechanical Plant of the Ministry of Defense of Ukraine
- SE Central Design Bureau Chernomoret
- SE Special Production-Technical Base Program
- SE Science Research Center Verbolgot
- SE Radiocommunications Design Bureau.

Of those 13, 10 continue operations as separate entities.

By the order #118 from February 28, 2015 «On Certain Issues of the Property Nationalization», the occupation authorities of Sevastopol had nationalized the SE Radiocommunications Design Bureau and unofficially liquidated it thereafter.

SE Skloplast has become part of the JSC Feodosia Shipyard Morye that after auctioning off will be transferred to the Kalashnikov concern.

The SE Central Design Bureau Chernomoret ceased to exist, having become the Sevastopol Shipyard’s design center.

The Monitoring Group of the Black Sea Institute of Strategic Studies, the BSNews and the Maidan of Foreign Affairs has identified 59 Russian companies that collaborate with the seized Crimean enterprises and therefore, are the primary candidates for sanctions.

The commissioning ceremony for Viktor, the third missile boat of the Kasatka 26000 project, at the Morye Shipyard, December 2017. Photo by the Russian Ministry of Defense

Note that as of now, 52 of the 10 seized and 59 collaborating enterprises, are not on any sanctions lists at all.

All enterprises are listed in Annexes 49 and 50. The presence or absence of the enterprises in sanctions list could be seen there as well.

The Russian companies that collaborate with the Crimean Ukrboronprom enterprises include:

1. Nine large shipyards, namely:
   1) JSC Pella Shipyard that leases 12 Shipyard Morye facilities for the construction of small missile vessels of the 22600 Kasatka project. Currently, three rocket ships are being built. Specifically for operation at the Morye Shipyard, Pella Shipyard has created its subsidiary Kaffo-Port, Ltd.
   2) JSC Yaroslav Shipbuilding Plant. In July 2018, the A160-YR project diving boat Vodolaz Kuzminsh was completed at the Morye shipyard. The boat’s body was built at the Yaroslav Shipyard and in autumn 2016 transferred to Pella for completion. The Yaroslav Shipbuilding Plant is the A160-YR project developer.
   3) JSC Nikolaevsky Teplokhod Shipyard. In September 2016, the naval emergency...
Sevastopol Science and Technology Center Impulse-2 was included in the RF register of the defense industry enterprises and has participated in designing the combat modules for military robotic systems.

Develops and builds drones. Together with the Science and Technology Center Impulse-2, was one of the developers of the Unmanned Combat Ground Vehicle (UCGV) Udar (Vihir).

1. OISC Kuntssov Design Bureau, Moscow. Member of the JSC Defense Systems, controlled in turn, by the Oboronprom corporation. Develops radio-electronic and radio-engineering products, weapons and special equipment. Specializes in the development of air defense systems.

Together with the Science and Technology Center Impulse-2, was one of the developers of the Unmanned Combat Ground Vehicle (UCGV) Udar (Vihir).

2. OISC 766 UPTK, Moscow oblast, Krasnogorsk. Specializes in the development and production of weapons and military equipment. The main product is unmanned military units.

3. OISC 766 UPTK, Moscow oblast, Zelenograd. Specializes in the design, development, and manufacturing of the modern weapons control systems.

Uran-9 Combat Robotic System, designed by Sevastopol Science and Technology Center Impulse-2. Photo by the 766 UPTK press-service.

Was a developer of the M12-03 combat module that is a part of the UCVG Vihir created in collaboration with the Science and Technology Center Impulse-2.

4. JSC Burevestnik, Nizhny Novgorod. Member of the UralVagonZavod research and Production Corporation. Produces and modernizes artillery and mortar weapons. The company has been officially assigned to the Science and Technology Center Impulse-2 to supply the latter with orders.

The JSC Burevestnik was a developer of the MBT-93 combat module for the UCVG Vihir created in collaboration with the Science and Technology Center Impulse-2.

5. JSC Central Research Institute Burevestnik, Nizhny Novgorod. Member of the Research and Production Corporation. Produces and modernizes artillery and mortar weapons.

By the orders of the RF Ministry of Industry and Trade, the JSC Burevestnik was a developer of the MBT-93 combat module for the UCVG Vihir created in collaboration with the Science and Technology Center Impulse-2.


Developed software for the distance control module of the UCVG Vihir created in collaboration with the Science and Technology Center Impulse-2.

7. JSC Scientific and Technical Center Elton, Moscow oblast, Zelenograd. Specializes in the design, development, and manufacturing of the modern weapons control systems.

Uran-9 Combat Robotic System has been used during the Russian military operation in Syria.
The maintenance of the Be-12 amphibian aircraft for Russian Navy in cooperation with the Beriev Taganrog Aviation Scientific Technical Complex, as well as SU-25 jet-aircrafts in cooperation with Aviation Repair Plant 121 from Moscow region, was organized at the Yevpatoria Aviation Repair Plant.
The Geography of Connections

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Connections</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>St. Petersburg</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moscow</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Krasnodar Krai</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tatarstan</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arkhangelsk Oblast</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vladimir Oblast</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moscow Oblast</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yaroslavl Oblast</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Astrakhan Oblast</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kaliningrad Oblast</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leningrad Oblast</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tula Oblast</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sverdlovsk Oblast</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nizhny Novgorod Oblast</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primorsky Krai</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bashkortostan</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Connections</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vologda Oblast</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voronezh Oblast</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dagestan</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kaluga Oblast</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Murmansk Oblast</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Novgorod Oblast</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Novosibirsk Oblast</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Omsk Oblast</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rostov Oblast</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Samara Oblast</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saratov Oblast</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tver Oblast</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Udmurtia</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ulyanovsk Oblast</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Khabarovsk Krai</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chelyabinsk Oblast</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Distribution of the Russian Connections by Industry

- Ship building, repair and equipment: 47 (40%)
- Aerospace manufacturing, repair and equipment: 10 (9%)
- Military equipment manufacturing, instrument building and design: 38 (32%)
- Crimean enterprises: 22 (19%)
- Other enterprises: 33
We recommend that NATO should create the new logistics base / regional center for maritime operations in Constanta, Romania.

**Threats to Ukraine in the Black and Azov seas**

- The Odesa field
- The Holitsyn field
- The Shtormove and Archangelsk fields

The actual «hot» war on the Black and Azov Seas against the coastal regions of Ukraine, as well as Georgia and Moldova, based on Crimea's military power, are completely realistic scenarios for 2019 that should be on the diplomat and military commandement desks.
✓ Restricted Area

- Vessels’ calls-in prohibition (except as otherwise specified)
- No economic activity
- Risks mitigation for mariners
- Disclaim all responsibility of Ukraine for any accidents that may occur as a result of actions of the Russian Federation in the inland sea waters and territorial sea of Ukraine around the Crimean peninsula
- Enforcement of the Act of Ukraine 'On Securing the Rights and Freedoms of Citizens and the Legal Regime on the Temporarily Occupied Territory of Ukraine'
New ships of the Russian coast guard in the Sea of Azov were relocated from the Northern Fleet and the Baltic Fleet (2018 – 2019)

Firstly, Ukraine needs a sea border in the Azov Sea. We must inform the world that the 2003 Azov Sea Treaty is no longer valid and therefore, in accordance with the UN Convention on the Law of the Sea, we declare Ukrainian territorial waters there and will protect this border.

In addition to the sea border in the Azov Sea, Ukraine needs sanctions against the Russian ports on the Black and Azov Seas in response to the fact that over the last five years, Russian Federation have been carrying out marine transportation to the ports of the occupied Crimea.
State Boundary Protection Line
Established by the Decree of the President of Ukraine on 06.10.1998 No 515
• Russia is unlikely to sign a delimitation agreement with Ukraine, but the Delimitation Commission Report will be of great political and diplomatic importance, and also serve as a basis for concluding a Maritime Border Delimitation Agreement between Ukraine and the Russian Federation upon the changing political situation in Russia.

• Without establishing a maritime border with the Russian Federation, Ukraine will never be able to exercise its national sovereignty to the fullest extent within major part of its own territorial sea, to exercise rights within the exclusive (maritime) economic zone and / or continental shelf, to use sea natural resources legally.
In 2019, the number of visits of NATO ships to the Black Sea increased again.
In 2019, the number of visits of NATO ships to the Black Sea increased again.

January and February 2019

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Dates</th>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>17.12 - 02.01.2019</td>
<td>H87 &quot;Echo&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>06.01 - 11.01.2019</td>
<td>LSD43 &quot;Fort McHenry&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>19.01 - 28.01.2019</td>
<td>DDG75 &quot;Donald Cook&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>19.02 - 09.03.2019</td>
<td>A514 &quot;Werra&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>19.02 - 01.03.2019</td>
<td>DDG75 &quot;Donald Cook&quot;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

January and February 2020

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Dates</th>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>24.01.2020 - 04.02.2020</td>
<td>M1058 &quot;Fulda&quot;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
We recommend that NATO should create A2/AD in Romania (anti-access and area denial).

The shooting range of the RF sea-based and coastal missile complexes from the occupied Crimea and the naval base of the Russian Federation in Tartus, Syria.